

MAJOR EXAMINATION: SEMESTER II 2015-16

HUL 256: CRITICAL THINKING

Monday 09 May 2016

Marks: 40

Time: Two Hours

Each question carries Equal Marks

1. By virtue of what common criterion, in respect of the relation between Free Will and Determinism, are both **Libertarianism (LIB)** and **Hard Determinism (HAD)** two opposing versions of Incompatibilism?

In your own critical assessment, given the common incompatibilist criterion that both **LIB** and **HAD** are in accord with, which of the two positions strikes you as the more plausible one, and why? [11 Marks]

2. What is "soft" about the so-called theory of **Soft Determinism (SOD)**? What is the main objection of **SOD** against the "hard" version of Determinism (i.e. **HAD**)?

Do you have any reasons *either* for criticizing the objections of **SOD** against **HAD**, or for supporting **HAD** against **SOD** on the ground that its anti-**HAD** argument is weak? [11Marks]

3. One of the requirements of freedom, according to Raymond Tallis, is that **we be able genuinely to deflect the course of events** in nature. But how is it possible to "deflect" the course of events (or remake the world) in nature if everything, including us humans, is bound by the laws of nature?

Answer this question on the basis of Tallis's reference to John Stuart Mill's view of liberty or freedom, and also explain why this view of freedom is **compatibilist** rather than incompatibilist. [11 Marks]

4. Proposition-A, "Santa Claus does not lie", is a **subject-predicate** statement: the subject is *Santa Claus* and the predicate *does not lie* is predicated of the subject. (It means that there is someone who is Santa Claus, and who has the property of "being a non-lier".) Is proposition-B, "Santa Claus does not exist", which is similar in grammatical form to proposition-A, also a subject-predicate statement?

Assume that proposition-B is a subject-predicate statement, and analyze it in the same way as proposition-A is analyzed, and thereby demonstrate that the logical corollary of this analysis of proposition-B is a **contradiction**. [7 Marks]